No.GDA-TECH-4(66)/2024 Dated: 17th December, 2024

GRIEVANCES REDRESSAL COMMITTEE REPORT

FOR

"Installation of Solar Street Lights in Gilgit City (Phase-IV)."

A) Report:

1. The subject report is submitted in pursuance to the Notification vide No.GDA-TECH-4(66)/2024 dated 22nd October, 2024. As per above noted notification a Grievance Redressal Committee has been constituted regarding any grievances Submitted by the bidders pertaining subject tendering process.

B) Back Ground:

2. The subject scheme was approved by the Government of Gilgit-Baltistan through Annual Development Plan at a cost of Rs.100.000 Million. Accordingly notice inviting tenders was floated to procure Services of well reputed and competent Firms/Contractors/JVs as per laid down criteria.
3. Advertisement under single stage two Envelop procedure was initially published in print and electronic media vide TS548849E on 30th September, 2024 mentioning 16th October, 2024 as submission and opening date for bids **(Annex-A),** the same was rescheduled to 23rd October 2024 vide corrigendum issued by the office of Deputy Director (Engineering), GDA **(Annexure-B).**
4. Bid opening committee was constituted by Competent Authority vide Notification No.GDA-TECH-4(66)/2024/ dated the 22nd October, 2024 **(Annexure-B).**
5. The committee opened the tender documents on 23rd October 2024 at 11:30 AM in the office of Deputy Director (Engineering), GDA / Chairman of the committee in the presence of bidder's representatives. The process of technical evaluation of bids was completed on 30th November 2024 on the basis of laid down criteria. The summarized technical evaluation report was uploaded on GB-PPRA website (www.gbppra.org.pk) on 03-12-2024 (**Annexure-C**).
6. As per PPRA rule 48 a Grievances Redressal committee was notified on 22nd October 2024 under the Chairmanship of Director (Engineering), GDA and comprising of two members, Assistant Director (Accounts), GDA and Assistant Director (Land Development). GDA to address the grievance of contractors if any. During due course of time two number of firms namely M/S MEFA Industries jv M/S Wazir Imtiaz and M/S ATS JV M/S Gulab Khan JV M/S Haji Umar Yar & Sons submitted applications expressing their grievances on pre-qualification results. (**Annexure-D**).
7. A meeting of Grievances Redressal Committee has been held under the chairmanship of Director Engineering GDA/Chairman of the committee on 11th , 12th and 16th December 2024 to revisit the evaluation process of the tender.

C) **Findings:**

Bid evaluation process revealed that total 10 No bidders submitted their proposals out of which three no of bidders were declared responsive on fulfilling laid down conditions whereas seven no of firms were disqualified.

i) 06 no of firms have been disqualified with remarks that they are not qualifying the mandatory conditions.

ii) M/S MEFA Industries JV M/S Wazir Imtiaz has been disqualified on the basis of not obtaining required marks in category of "Firm Experience" with remarks that the lead partner does not qualified the mandatory projects experience.

iii) M/S ATS JV M/S Gulab Khan JV M/S Haji Umar Yar & Sons has been disqualified with remarks that the firm did not qualified mandatory conditions (do not have a valid dealership for the Lithium Batteries for Solar Street Lights and LED Solar Lights)

D) **Observations of the GRC.**

- Upon detailed examination of the tender evaluation conducted by the Tender Evaluation Committee, it was observed that the projects of a general nature submitted by firm M/S MEFA Industries JV M/S Wazir Imtiaz were erroneously not considered during the evaluation process. This oversight resulted in the incorrect assessment of the applicant's qualifications.
- The GRC also identified that the formula applied for calculating the collective marks of JV firms was unjustified. This miscalculation impacted the evaluation results for all bidders who submitted their bids in Joint Venture or consortium, including M/S MEFA Industries JV M/S Wazir Imtiaz.

E) **Recommendations: -**

In the light of above findings, the GRC recommends following decisions.

i) As the general nature projects of M/S MEFA Industries JV M/S Wazir Imtiaz were not marked in evaluation due to which the firm was disqualified. The re-evaluation revealed that M/S MEFA Industries JV M/S Wazir Imtiaz obtained 20 marks out of 35 marks in category of projects which is more than 50% of the total marks and to fulfill the passing criteria. Hence the GRC carried out further evaluation of the firm and declared the M/S MEFA Industries JV M/S Wazir Imtiaz as responsive firm for the subject project.

ii) The 2nd firm M/S ATS JV M/S Gulab Khan JV M/S Haji Umar Yar & Sons was disqualified on not having a direct dealership of the required items of Solar street lights as per laid down criteria. The GRC re-evaluated the technical bid of the consortium and re-cheked the authorization of the firm which shows that the Consortium collectively or individually do not have any dealership of a

manufacturer for the required items, a local distributor has authorized M/S ATS for submission bid and certified to provide required items. The GRC accepted the authorization and evaluated the firm's experience. Detail evaluation revealed that the JV partners of the consortium does not qualified the mandatory criteria in projects of similar nature completed and in hand. Thus the firm did not qualify for the project.

iii) In light of above facts, it is recommended to declare M/S MEFA Industries JV M/S Wazir Imtiaz as **"Responsive Firm"** and M/S ATS JV M/S Gulab Khan JV M/S Haji Umar Yar & Sons will remain as **"Non-Responsive".**

Mr. Jamsheed Alam
Assistant Director (Accounts)
Gilgit Development Authority
(Member)

Mr. Asif Umer
Assistant Director (Land Development)
Gilgit Development Authority
(Member)

Engr. Arif Hussain
Director (Engineering)
Gilgit Development Authority
Chairman